Testing Fundamental Gravity with Lunar Laser Ranging

<u>Simone Dell'Agnello (for the SCF_Lab Team)</u> INFN-LNF, Via Enrico Fermi 40, Frascati (Rome), 00044, Italy

INFN-LNF, Frascati, February 10, 2014



SCF_Lab Team @INFN-LNF

Simone Dell'Agnello, Delle Monache G., Vittori R., Boni A., Cantone C., Ciocci E., Lops C., Martini M., Patrizi G., Tibuzzi M., Maiello M., Currie D., Bianco G., Intaglietta N., Salvatori L., Contessa S., Porcelli, L., Tuscano, P., Mondaini, C.

INFN-LNF, Frascati (Rome), Italy





We acknowledge important support/contracts from/with: ASI, ESA & Galileo, Italian Ministry of Defense/Air Force, ISRO





- Introduction to Satellite and Lunar Laser Ranging
- Lunar Laser Ranging to laser retroreflectors
- SCF_Lab Research Infrastructure @ INFN-LNF
- Science program and SCF_Lab Activities
- Lunar mission opportunities

Introduction to Science



- Improved Test of Gravity with refined analysis of, and LLR data from, Apollo and Lunokhod reflectors
 - Launched 1969-1972, NASA, ROSKOSMOS.
 - Uninterrupted LLR data since 69. By ILRS; also ASI-Matera from 2010
 - Accurate thermal-optical-orbital modeling. With Maryland
 - General Relativity analysis. **PEP** with CfA (USA)
 - New theories of gravity and Solar System constraints with IST Lisbon, Univ. Porto
- Improved Tests of Gravity (up to x100) and improved Selenodesy (lunar interior) **MoonLIGHT**
- New Enabling Technology for Gravity, Planetary Exploration and Geodesy **INRRI**
- Independent missions, though part of unitary program



Satellite Laser Ranging (SLR) Lunar Laser Ranging (LLR)

Time of Flight (ToF) measurements

Satellite/Lunar Laser Ranging (SLR/LRR)

ř



- GeoMetroDynamics (GMD) in space
- Unambiguous <u>position/distance</u> measurement (so-called 'laser range') to cube corner retroreflectors (CCRs) with

short laser pulses and a time-of-flight technique

• <u>Time-tagging</u> with H-maser clocks

- **Precise** positioning (normal points at mm level, orbits at cm level)
- Absolute accuracy (used to define Earth center of mass, geocenter, and scale of length)
- **Passive**, maintenance-free Laser Retroreflector Arrays (**LRAs**)

Moon



Earth



(Precise). AND. (cost-effective) distance measurement in space

Cube Corner laser Retroreflectors (CCRs)







LLR/SLR vs. ground survey/alignment



An ILRS station is like a gigantic *total station* theodolite measuring angles & distances of CCRs in ordinary surveys and alignements on Earth. For example to build large physics installations, like particle physics experiments (ATLAS, KLOE, CDF, ..) and particle beam



accelerators (LHC, DAFNE, Tevatron, ...)

Leica TC2002. Great instrument: ToF theodolite with IR laser 0.1-0.2 mm (after interferometer calibration) few microrad accuracy

However, surveys for particle physics usually done indoor at approximately isothermal conditions, over short baselines (2 to hundreds of meters). With LLR/SLR things are completely different

Cube Corner laser Retroreflectors (CCRs)



So-called "prisms" used for ground measurements by "geometers", for ex mounted inside opened spheres, with the corner coincident with the center of the sphere



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

On ground: theodolite (or laser "tracker"), retroreflector, time-of-flight





Usato for positioning metrology of large physics installations and Experiments like KLOE particle physics experiment at the LNF DAΦNE accelerator and ATLAS/CMS @CERN

SLR concept

ILRS stations: Matera, Herstmonceux, Graz, OCR





Flight payload for GPS-2 @INFN-LNF: 32 CCRs (property of Univ. Maryland)







LAGEOS I ('76; NASA), LAGEOS II ('92; NASA/ASI)

Laser Geodynamic Satellite Experiment (LAGEOS) LAGEOS satellites reflect laser beams transmitted from ground stations back to sensors on Earth. The first

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

Laser Geodynamics Satellites (LAGEOS)



LAGEOS I (1976; NASA), LAGEOS II (1992; NASA/ASI)



Laser Geodynamic Satellite Experiment (LAGEOS) LAGEOS satellites reflect laser beams transmitted from ground stations back to sensors on Earth. The first

LAGEOS "Sector", an engineering prototype proporty of NASA-GSFC, SCF-Tested at INFN-LNF





S. Dell'Agin HN (LINFNF& B) 2014



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al





LAGEOS (h ~ 6000 km): ToF ~ 0.05 sec



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

SLR/LLR examples







S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

Apollo Missions





- R. H. Dicke et al: laser tracking of Moon with traditional light pulses for gravity testsin the 50s
- Laser invented ~1960



- MIT and URSS shoot laser light to Moon surface in the 60s
- Retroreflectors deployed by Apollo 11, 14, 15





- Apollo: CCR arrays of fused silica with circular aperture of 3.8 cm diameter each
- Apollo 11 e 14: used 100 CCRs
- Apollo 15: 300 CCRs



Relative sizes and separation of the Earth–Moon. An LLR pulse takes 1.255 sec for the mean orbital distance.

Locations of 1st Gen. Lunar Retroreflector Arrays



"Centro di Geodesia Spaziale (CGS) *Giuseppe Colombo*" Matera, Italy Tri-colocated within ITRF by SLR, VLBI, GNSS

Slide courtesy of G. Bianco



MLRO, Matera Laser Ranging Observatory LLR since March 2010 Led by G. Bianco, also Chairman of ILRS Governing Board











3-station colocation, OCA-CERGA, Obs. du Calern, France (courtesy of)



Two unique OGSE (Optical Ground Support Equipment) facilities, in clean room to characterize the thermal and optical behavior of laser retroreflectors in lab-simulated space environment (532, 633, 1064 nm)



SCF_Lab @INFN-LNF



Two world-unique **OGSE** (Optical Ground Support Equipment) facilities in a clean room to characterize the space segment of laser ranging altimetry. *In 'INFN jargon': "test beam of laser retroreflector detectors"*



SCF for SLR/LLR/ GNSS/ Altimetry (RD-1, RD-2)







Two AM0/space Solar Simulators



SCA

Optical measurements: FFDP & Interferometry

S CA

SCF_Lab measurements

- Far Field Diffraction Pattern (FFDP)
 measurement in Air of all 55 CCR
- SCF-Test
- Simulated orbital measurement

Introduced interferometric measurements from a commercial fizeau interferometer



GPS/Galileo laser Retroreflector Array (GRA)



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

31



With SCF can measure/model subtle thermal effects, and optimize thermal conductance of retroreflector mounting

199.3

SCF-Test

IR Heat Flow Due to Tab Supports

Thermal modeling (noon on Moon)





SCF-Test/Revision-ETRUSCO-2 (ASI-INFN)



- Laboratory-simulated space conditions. Concurrent/integrated:
 - Dark/cold/vacuum
 - Sun/Albedo AM0 simulators (2) and Earth IR simulator
 - Non-invasive IR and contact **thermometry**
 - Laser interrogation and sun perturbation at varying angles
 - Payload thermal control, roto-translations
 - Critical orbit configurations (worst-case thermal-optical behavior)
- Deliverables / Retroreflector Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)
 - Thermal behavior (τ_{CCR} , thermal relaxation time)
 - Optical response: Far Field Diffraction Patter, (near-field) Wavefront
 Fizeau Interferogram
- Integrated thermal-optical simulations (upon request)

Note: reduced, partial, incomplete tests (compared to the realistic space environment) are randomly misleading (either optimistic or pessimistic)



J. Adv. Space Res. 47 (2011) 822-842

Creation of the new industry-standard space test of laser retroreflectors for the GNSS and LAGEOS

S. Dell'Agnello ^{a,*}, G.O. Delle Monache^a, D.G. Currie^b, R. Vittori^{c,d}, C. Cantone^a, M. Garattini^a, A. Boni^a, M. Martini^a, C. Lops^a, N. Intaglietta^a, R. Tauraso^{e,a}, D.A. Arnold^f, M.R. Pearlman^f, G. Bianco^g, S. Zerbini^h, M. Maiello^a, S. Berardi^a, L. Porcelli^a, C.O. Alley^b, J.F. McGarryⁱ, C. Sciarretta^g, V. Luceri^g, T.W. Zagwodzkiⁱ

^a Laboratori Nazionali di Frascati (LNF) dell'INFN via E. Fermi 40, 00044 Frascati, Rome, Italy
 ^b University of Maryland (UMD), Department of Physics, John S. Toll Building, Regents Drive, College Park, MD 20742-4111, USA
 ^c Aeronautica Militare Italiana, Viale dell' Università 4, 00185 Rome, Italy
 ^d Agenzia Spaziale Italiana (ASI), Viale Liegi 26, 00198 Rome, Italy
 ^e University of Rome "Tor Vergata", Dipartimento di Matematica, Via della Ricerca Scientifica, 00133 Rome, Italy
 ^e University of Rome "Tor Vergata", Dipartimento di Matematica, Via della Ricerca Scientifica, 00133 Rome, Italy
 ^e Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics (CfA), 60 Garden Street, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA
 ^g ASI, Centro di Geodesia Spaziale "G. Colombo" (ASI-CGS), Località Terlecchia, P.O, Box ADP, 75100 Matera, Italy
 ^b University of Bologna, Department of Physics Sector of Geophysics, Viale Berti Pichat 8, 40127 Bologna, Italy
 ^c NASA, Goddard Space Flight Center (GSCF), code 694, Greenbelt, MD 20771, USA



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

Setting CCR standards @SCF_Lab





Some young people of the SCF_LAB Team.

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

SCF-Test of MoonLIGHT prototype







SCF: CCR Temperatures, optical FFDP (no sunshade)



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

SCF: Optical response of MoonLIGHT (no sun shade



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al



Experiment of INFN National Scientific Committee 2 (CSN2) for 2013-2018: MoonLIGHT-2

Moon Laser Instrumentation for General relativity High accuracy Tests – Phase 2



Lunar Laser Ranging (LLR) Science



- Suite of precision tests of General Relativity (GR) with single experiment
- Study of lunar geophysics (Selenodesy)
- Lunar Geophysical Network (LGN)



IMRF:

Apollo/Lunokohd, MEX, Astrobotic, C-ILN/GLXP, SELENE-2, Chandrayaan-2, LGN landers/rovers

ITRF/IMRF: International Terrestrial/Moon Reference Frame

LLR science GR and Selenodesy







S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

MoonLIGHT / LLRRA21 (cartoon no to scale)



S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al



Current dominant error on LLR





Sensing Array Size/Orientation of Apollo reflectors

Effect of multi-CCR array orientation due to lunar librations



Apollo arrays: to get 2 cm range out of +/- 1 nsec ToF distribution, thousands of laser returns are needed. With MoonLIGHT: with just 1 return we get a mm/sub-mm range

LLR ToF residuals with PEP, the



Planetary Ephemeris Program by CfA

Data by station from 1969 to 2009

The model parameter estimates are refined by minimizing the residual differences, weighted leastsquares sense, between observations (O) & model predictions by PEP (C= Computation)



Within a single day, differences between (O-C)'s should have a very small variation. We study the quantity |max(O-C)-min(O-C)| for days where multiple measurements were recorded for Apollo 11, 14 and 15

LLR tests of General Relativity



Science measurement / Precision test of	Time scale	Apollo/Lunokhod	MoonLIGHT	
violation of General Relativity		few cm accuracy*	1 mm	0.1 mm
Parameterized Post-Newtonian (PPN) β	Few years	β-1 <1.1×10 ⁻⁴	10-5	10-6
Weak Equivalence Principle (WEP)	Few years	$ \Delta a/a < 1.4 \times 10^{-13}$	10-14	10-15
Strong Equivalence Principle (SEP)	Few years	lηl<4.4×10 ⁻⁴	3×10 ⁻⁵	3×10 ⁻⁶
Time Variation of the Gravitational Constant	~5 years	Ġ/G <9×10 ⁻¹³ yr ⁻¹	5×10 ⁻¹⁴	5×10 ⁻¹⁵
Inverse Square Law (ISL)	~10 years	α <3×10 ⁻¹¹	10-12	10-13
Geodetic Precession	Few years	$ K_{gp} < 6.4 \times 10^{-3}$	6.4×10 ⁻⁴	6.4×10 ⁻⁵

* J. G. Williams, S. G. Turyshev, and D. H. Boggs, PRL 93, 261101 (2004)

Our measurement of the Geodetic Precession with Apollo/Lunokohd, including new APOLLO station, with Planetary Ephemeris Program (PEP) by CfA: ~1% accuracy

Number of laser returns to make a "standard" ~2-cm LLR range:

- MoonLIGHT single, large reflector: ~1
- Apollo/Lunokhod/Luna-Glob multi-reflector array: few thousands

LLR measurement of geodetic precession



3-body effect (Sun, Earth, Moon) predicted by GR:

precession of a moving gyroscope (the Moon orbiting the Earth) in the field of the Sun The precession due simply to the presence of a central mass is $\sim (3.00 \pm 0.02) \text{m/M}_{\text{orbit}} \sim 2^{"/\text{cy}}$



Relative deviation of geodetic precession from GR value: JPL: J. G. Williams et al 2004 PRL. 93, 261101 $K_{GP} = (-1.9 \pm 6.4) \times 10^{-3}$ Our measurement with CfA's software (Planetary Ephemeris Program): ~ 1% accuracy

LLR data give unique science products both in relativistic gravity AND in lunar geophysics.

 $\Omega_{\rm G}$ geodetic precession r_0 circular orbit radius **v** gyroscope velocity r position vector G gravitational constant M central body mass

Limits on 1/r² deviations in the Solar System

MoonLIGHT designed to provide accuracy of 100µm or better on tspace segment (the CCR), if deployed by drilling the regolith (Lunar Google X Prize, Astrobotic mission)

If other error sources on LLR will improve with time at the same level, then MoonLIGHT CCRs will improve limits on α from ~10⁻¹⁰ to ~10⁻¹² at scales λ of ~10⁶ meters Limits on additional Yukawa potential: $\alpha \times (Newtonian-gravity) \times e^{-r/\lambda}$



Unique to LLR: test Strong EP (and PPN β)



Williams et al, arXiv: gr-qc/0507083v2, 2 Jan 2009

• LLR test of EP sensitive to *both* composition-dependent (CD) and self-energy violations

```
UW: Baessler et al, PRL 83, 3585 (1999);
Adelberger et al Cl. Q. Gravity 12, 2397 (2001)
```

• University of Washington (UW) laboratory EP experiment with "miniature" Earth and Moon, measures *only* CD contribution:

 $[(M_G/M_I)_{earth} - [(M_G/M_I)_{moon}]_{WEP,UW} = (1.0 \pm 1.4) \times 10^{-13}$

 $[(M_G/M_I)_{earth} - [(M_G/M_I)_{moon}]_{WEP,LLR} = (-1.0 \pm 1.4) \times 10^{-13}$

- Subtracting UW from LLR results one gets the SEP test: $[(M_G/M_I)_{earth} - [(M_G/M_I)_{moon}]_{SEP} = (-2.0 \pm 2.0) \times 10^{-13}$
 - Assuming Nordtvedt effect: limit PPN parameter β at 10⁻⁴ SEP can only be tested LLR



Rotation/Librations: well measured by LNF

1980s to 2009 Red: dedicated APOLLO station (T. Murphy)

We study the quantity ||max(O-C)|-|min(O-C)|| for days where multiple measurements were recorded for Apollo 11, 14 and 15.

This difference is small, showing that the relative Earth rotations and lunar librations are well modeled by PEP

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

Test of geodetic precession \mathbf{K}_{GP} with LLR

- 5th test of General Relativity
- First measured at **2% accuracy** in 1988 by Shapiro et al
- CfA+LNF current accuracy with PEP, Apollo arrays and APOLLO laser station: **1%**
 - M. Martini et al, Planetary and Space Science 74 (2012) 276–282
- Comparable with accuracy by JPL =0.64%
 J. G. Williams et al, PRL 93, 261101 (2004)
- Gravity Probe B final result on GP, accuracy: **=0.28%**
 - C.W. F. Everitt et al, PRL 106, 221101 (2011)

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

MoonLIGHT Pointing System (MPS)

Two motors + CCD (to locate Earth and point it after landing) Stowage screen (for dust protection during landing); ~1.3 kg

INFN-LNF Feb. 10 2014

- Pointing requirement: about +/- 2°
- MoonLIGHT Needs an Automatic Pointing System
- Needs Only a Start Pulse
- Operational Sequence (at equator site)
 - Point to Zenith
 - Take a Camera Exposure
 - Fit Earth Image (On-Board)
 - If Missing -Search off Zenith
- Lock Brakes

Moon Express-1 Mission to the Moon

Company News Missions Careers Shop Contact

We Are Going to the Moon

Moon Express is the first company to flight test a prototype lunar lander system developed in partnership with NASA.

Newest Blog Post

Learn More

- - -

Latest Press Release

Available Jobs

 Constact
 Social Media
 Mailing List

 Missing List
 Mailing List
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants

 Missing List
 Missing List
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants

 Missing List
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants

 Missing List
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants

 Missing List
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants
 Subscription for the monotonic splatiants

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

Moon Express-1 Mission Concept

S. Dell'Agnello (INFN-LNF) et al

SCA

MoonLIGHT on MEX-1 top deck Launch by Dec 2105

Astrobotic Landing Mission to the Moon

Acronyms and definitions

- 1. AM0: Air Mass Zero
- 2. ASI: Agenzia Spaziale Italiana
- 3. BT: Break Through
- 4. <u>CCR: Cube Corner Retroreflector</u>
- 5. EO = Earth Observation
- 6. ESA: European Space Agency
- ETRUSCO: Extra Terrestrial Ranging to Unified Satellite Constellation
- 8. <u>FFDP: Far Field Diffraction Pattern</u>
- 9. FOC: Full Orbit Capability
- 10. GCO: GNSS Critical half Orbit
- 11. GMES = Global Monitoring for Environment and Security
- 12. GNSS : Global Navigation Satellite System
- 13. GPS: Global Positioning System
- 14. GRA: GNSS Retroreflector Arrays

- 13. GTRF: Galileo Terrestrial Reference Frame
- 14. ILRS: International Laser Ranging Service
- 15. IOV: In Orbit Validation
- 16. IPR: Intellectual Property Rights
- 17. ITRF: International Terrestrial Reference Frame
- 18. ITRS: International Terrestrial Reference System
- 19. KPI: Key Performance Indicator
- 20. OCS: Optical Cross Section
- 21. LAGEOS: LAser GEOdynamics Satellite
- 22. <u>SCF: Satellite/lunar/GNSS laser ranging and</u> <u>altimetry Characterization Facility</u>
- 23. <u>SCF-G: Satellite laser ranging Characterization</u> <u>Facility optimized for GNSS</u>
- 24. SLR: Satellite Laser Ranging
- 25. TIR: Total Internal Reflection
- 26. WI: Wavefront Interferogram

Main Reference Documents

- [RD-1] Dell'Agnello, S., et al, Creation of the new industry-standard space test of laser retroreflectors for the GNSS and LAGEOS, J. Adv. Space Res. 47 (2011) 822–842.
- [RD-2] P. Willis, Preface, Scientific applications of Galileo and other Global Navigation Satellite Systems (II), J. Adv. Space Res., 47 (2011) 769.
- [RD-3] D. Currie, S. Dell'Agnello, G. Delle Monache, A Lunar Laser Ranging Array for the 21st Century, Acta Astron. 68 (2011) 667-680.
- [RD-4] Dell'Agnello, S., et al, Fundamental physics and absolute positioning metrology with the MAGIA lunar orbiter, Exp Astron, October 2011, Volume 32, <u>Issue 1, pp 19-35</u> ASI Phase A study.
- [RD-5] Dell'Agnello, S. et al, A Lunar Laser Ranging Retro-Reflector Array for NASA's Manned Landings, the International Lunar Network and the Proposed ASI Lunar Mission MAGIA, Proceedings of the 16th International Workshop on Laser Ranging, Space Research Centre, Polish Academy of Sciences Warsaw, Poland, 2008.
- [RD-6] International Lunar Network (http://iln.arc.nasa.gov/), Core Instrument and Communications Working Group Final Reports.
- [RD-7] Yi Mao, Max Tegmark, Alan H. Guth, and Serkan Cabi, Constraining torsion with Gravity Probe B, Physical Review D **76**, 104029 (2007).
- [RD-8] March, R., Bellettini, G., Tauraso, R., Dell'Agnello, S., Constraining spacetime torsion with the Moon and Mercury, Physical Review D 83, 104008 (2011).
- [RD-9] March, R., Bellettini, G., Tauraso, R., Dell'Agnello, S., Constraining spacetime torsion with LAGEOS, Gen Relativ Gravit (2011) 43:3099–3126.
- [RD-10] **ETRUSCO-2:** An ASI-INFN project of technological development and "SCF-Test" of GNSS LASER Retroreflector Arrays, S, Dell'Agnello, 3rd International Colloquium on on Scientific and Fundamental Aspects of the Galileo Programme, Copenhagen, Denmark, August 2011